राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग एवं अवसंरचना विकास निगम लिमिटेड
सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय, भारत सरकार
तीसरी मंजिल, पीटीआई बिल्डिंग, 4–संसद मार्ग, नई दिल्ली–110001

National Highways & Infrastructure Development Corporation Limited
Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Govt. of India
3rd Floor, PTI Building, 4-Parliament Street, New Delhi-110001, +91 11 23461600, www.nhidcl.com

BHARATMALA
ROAD TO PROSPERITY

BUILDING INFRASTRUCTURE - BUILDING THE NATION
CIN: U45400DL2014GOI269062

(भारत सरकार का उद्यम) (A Government of India Enterprise)

NHIDCL/Ar.Pr./Civil Work/ Doginala - Gau /2020 **Date: 16.12.2020**

To

All Respective Bidders,

Subject:- Construction of High Altitude Hill road from Doginala TO Gau from KM 0.000 to KM 15.320 in Upper Subansiri District of the state of Arunachal Pradesh on EPC Mode

Reference Tender ID: 2020_NHIDC_593235_1

Sir,

Please refer to bid submitted for the subject cited above. The following is the result of technical evaluation. The minutes of technical evaluation is enclosed.

Sr. No.	Name of the Bidder	Status
1	M/s Dev Yash Projects & Infrastructure Pvt. Ltd.	Technically Responsive
2	M/s Ganesh Ram Dokania	Technically Responsive
3	M/s Indian Electrical Services	**Technically Non Responsive**
4	M/s Indo Engineering Project Corporation	Technically Responsive
5	M/s Sudkhara Infratech Private Limited JV M/s LNS Infrastructure	**Technically Non Responsive(** As per clause 2.1.15 of RFP)
6	M/s Roadridge Developers Private Limited JV M/s Sunshine Overseas Private Limited	Technically Responsive
7	M/s Satya Builders	Technically Responsive

2. Financial bid of technical responsive bidders shall be opened on 18.12.2020 at 1100 hrs in NHIDCL, HQ, 3rd floor, PTI building, 4, Parliament Street, New Delhi-110001.

Encl:- As stated above

A.K.Jha
General Manager (Tech.)

National Highways & Infrastructure Development Corporation

2nd Minutes of Meetings of Technical Bid Evaluation Committee (TEC) for :" Construction of High Altitude Hill road from Doginala TO Gau from KM 0.000 to KM 15.320 in Upper Subansiri District of the state of Arunachal Pradesh on EPC Mode" held at NHIDCL, New Delhi at **on 15.12.2020.**

The bids for the subject work were invited and bids were received online on scheduled bid due date as 26.11.2020 at 1100 hrs.

2. The following bidders have submitted their bids online.

(i) M/s Dev Yash Projects & Infrastructure Pvt. Ltd.
(ii) M/s Ganesh Ram Dokania
(iii) M/s Indian Electrical Services
(iv) M/s Indo Engineering Project Corporation
(v) M/s Sudkhara Infratech Private Limited JV M/s LNS Infrastructure
(vi) M/s Roadridge Developers Private Limited JV M/s Sunshine Overseas Private Limited
(vii) M/s Satya Builders

3. The Evaluation Committee in reference to RFP has considered the following Evaluation Criteria for estimated project cost of **Rs 157.39 Crore.**

Sr.No.	Particulars	Amount in Rs. Cr.
1	Estimated Project Cost	157.39
2	Minimum Threshold Technical Capacity required (For Category 1, 2, 3 & 4) as per clause 2.2.2.2 (i)	78.70
3	Minimum Threshold Technical Capacity required (For Category 1, 2, 3 & 4) for Lead Member to fulfill as per clause 2.2.2.4 (i)	47.22
4	Minimum Threshold Technical Capacity required (For Category 1, 2, 3 & 4) for Other Member to fulfill as per clause 2.2.2.4 (i)	15.74
5	Minimum required amount of COMPLETED Eligible Projects in Category 1 and/or Category 3 from at least one similar work as per clause 2.2.2.2 (ii)	23.61
6	For a project to qualify as a Eligible Project under Category 1&2 , the Capital Cost of the project should be more than (as per clause 2.2.2.6 (i) (c))	7.87
7	Minimum required amount of self constructed project by the Bidder for a project to qualify as a Eligible Project under Category 1&2 (as per clause 2.2.2.6 (i) (d))	one half of the Project Cost of eligible projects as defined in clause 2.2.2.6 (i) (d).
8	For a project to qualify as a Eligible Project under Category 3&4 , the receipt / payments of the project should be more than (as per clause 2.2.2.6 (ii))	7.87
9	Minimum Financial capacity required as per clause 2.2.2.3	7.87
10	Minimum Financial Capacity required for Lead Member to fulfill as per clause 2.2.2.4 (i)	4.72
11	Minimum Financial Capacity required for Other Member to fulfill as per clause 2.2.2.4 (i)	1.57
12	Minimum Average Annual Turnover required as per clause 2.2.2.3 (ii)	23.61
13	Minimum Average Annual Turnover required (For Lead Member) as per clause	14.17

	2.2.2.4 (i)	
14	Minimum Average Annual Turnover required (For Other Member) as per clause 2.2.2.4 (i)	4.72
15	Minimum Required Bid Capacity (For each Bidder) as per clause 2.2.2.1	78.695
16	Minimum Required Bid Capacity (For Lead Member) as per clause 2.2.2.4 (i)	47.217
17	Minimum Required Bid Capacity (For Other Member) as per clause 2.2.2.4 (i)	15.739

4. **The Evaluation Committee** during evaluation found that some of the data/information provided by the Bidders are not adhering to the clauses given in the RFP document, so it was proposed that the clarification may be sought from the Bidders as per clause no 3.1.4 of the RFP to facilitate the evaluation process. Accordingly, the **Technical Evaluation Committee (TEC)** in its first meeting had decided that the clarification as requested by the Technical Division is to be sought from the respective bidders.

5. In Continuation to 1st Meeting of **Technical Evaluation Committee (TEC)** held on 09.12.2020, replies received from the bidders, the Evaluation report were deliberated by the TEC in 2nd meeting held on 15.12.2020.Some of the bidders have not given the year wise break up of receivable value for civil work reflected in the UDIN Certificate, therefore the value given by the statutory Auditor have been considered. The remarks of ETEC w.r.t the observations and reply received are tabulated below:

S.No	Name of the Bidder	Clarification to be sought	Reply received by the bidder	NHIDCL's Comment
1	M/s Dev Yash Projects & Infrastructure Pvt. Ltd.	(i) UDIN on ICAI Portal does not show the turnover of last 5 years. Please clarify	(i) The bidder has submitted the UDIN No which reflect year wise breakup of receivable value of the civil work	The reply submitted by the bidder has been scrutinized by the committee and found to be in order. Since the bidder is technically and financially eligible. Hence the committee decided to consider the bid as Technically responsive.
2	M/s Ganesh Ram Dokania	(i) UDIN on ICAI Portal does not show the turnover of last 5 years. Please clarify (ii) "Schedule G for Turnover" of Audited Balance sheet for FY 2018-19 could not be located. Please clarify (iii) The balance sheet for FY 2019-20 could not be located, if not audited then undertaking need to be submitted as per RFP section 2 clause 2.2.2.8 (ii). Please clarify	(i) The bidder has submitted the certificate from the Authority. (ii) Bidder has submitted the complete Audited Balance sheet for FY 2018-19 for turnover. (iii) Bidder has submitted undertaking regarding non submission of the Audited Balance sheet for FY 2019-20.	The reply submitted by the bidder has been scrutinized by the committee. Since the bidder is technically and financially eligible. Hence the committee decided to consider the bid as Technically responsive

3	M/s Indo Engineering Project Corporation	i) Audited Balance sheets for all 5 years are not located. Please clarify ii) Annexure III could not be located. Please Clarify iii) Name of the banker as stated in Para 6 on Annexure III could not be located. Please Clarify iv) The balance sheet for FY 2019-20 could not be located, if not audited then undertaking needs to be submitted as per RFP section 2 clause 2.2.2.8 (ii). Please clarify v) Appendix 1A Annexure IX could not be located. Please clarify	i) The bidder has submitted the Audited balance sheet of all five years. ii) The bidder has submitted Annexure III. iii) The bidder has submitted the name of the bank. iv) The bidder has submitted the undertaking for non submission of the Audited Balance sheet for FY 2019-20. v) The bidder has submitted Appendix 1A Annexure IX.	The reply submitted by the bidder has been scrutinized by the committee and found to be in order. Since the bidder is technically and financially eligible. Hence the committee decided to consider the bid as Technically responsive.
4	M/s Roadridge Developers Private Limited **JV** M/s Sunshine Overseas Private Limited	**a) M/s Roadridge Developers Private Limited** (i) UDIN on ICAI Portal does not show the turnover of last 5 years. Please clarify (ii) POA refers to "National Highway Authority of India" instead of National Highway & Infrastructural Development Corporation Limited. Please clarify **b) M/s Sunshine Overseas Private**	**a) M/s Roadridge Developers Private Limited** **i)** The bidder has submitted the UDIN No which reflect year wise breakup of receivable value of the civil work. ii) The bidder has submitted the corrected POA **b) M/s Sunshine Overseas Private Limited**	The reply submitted by the bidder has been scrutinized by the committee. Since the bidder is technically and financially eligible. Hence the committee decided to consider the bid as Technically responsive

		Limited (i) UDIN on ICAI Portal does not show the turnover of last 5 years. Please clarify (ii) POA refers to "National Highway Authority of India" instead of National Highway & Infrastructural Development Corporation Limited. Please clarify	**i)** The bidder has submitted the UDIN No which reflect year wise breakup of receivable value of the civil work. ii) The bidder has submitted the corrected POA	
5	M/s Satya Builders	(i) The balance sheet for FY 2019-20 could not be located, if not audited then undertaking need to be submitted as per RFP section 2 clause 2.2.2.8 (ii). Please clarify. **(ii)** UDIN on ICAI Portal does not show the turnover of last 5 years. Please clarify (iii) For consideration of single work under category 1 & 3, experience certificate from the authority could not be located .Please identify the page number and clarify. **(iv)** Designation of the authorised person in POA is not mentioned. Please clarify	i) The bidder has submitted the Undertaking for non availability of Audited Balance sheet for FY 2019-2020. ii) The bidder has submitted the UDIN No which reflect breakup of the receivable value of the civil work for the entire projects. iii) The bidder has submitted the Authority certificate for consideration of single work under category 1 & 3. iv) The bidder has clarified the designation of the authorised person.	The reply submitted by the bidder has been scrutinized by the committee. Since the bidder is technically and financially eligible. Hence the committee decided to consider the bid as Technically responsive.
6	M/s Indian Electrical Services	(i) As per RFP section 2 clause 2.2.2.3 (ii) Minimum Average Annual Turnover of 15%	It was observed that during evaluation the bidder had claimed net worth and Average	The Committee has scrutinized the submitted bid and observed that the claimed net worth of the firm is 7.06 Cr.

		(Fifteen percent) of the Estimated Project Cost for the last 5 (five) financial years should be 23.61 Cr. as per submitted certificate of Turnover by statutory Auditor the Average Annual Turnover is 21.36 Cr. which is less than the required. Please clarify (ii) As per RFP section 2 clause 2.2.2.3 (i) minimum Net Worth of 5% (five percent) of the Estimated Project Cost should be 7.87 Cr. as per submitted Audited Balance sheet for FY 2019-20 Net Worth is 7.06 Cr. Please clarify. (iii) As per submitted Audited Balance sheet for FY 2018-19, FY 2017-18, FY 2016-17 it has been observed that Gross Receipt includes supply work , other petty receipt & GST have been added and bifurcation of these receivable value could not be located. Please clarify. (iv) Provisional Balance sheet for FY 2015-16 is submitted. Please clarify	Annual turnover respectively less than the required as per RFP in view of that the clarification was mailed to the bidder on 10.12.2020 and had to submit the clarification by 12.12.2020 till 1700 Hrs. and bidder have not submitted any clarification	and Average Annual Turnover is 21.36 Cr. but as per RFP section 2 clause 2.2.2.3 (i) & (ii) minimum Net Worth of 5% (five percent) of the Estimated Project Cost should be 7.87 Cr. and Average Annual Turnover of 15% (Fifteen percent) of the Estimated Project Cost for the last 5 (five) financial years should be 23.61 Cr. Further, the bidder has not submitted the clarification in this regards. Hence the committee considered the Net Worth and Average Annual Turnover as submitted in the bid the committee consider the bid as Technically non responsive
7	M/s Sudhakara Infratech Private Limited JV M/s LNS Infrastructures	**a) M/s LNS Infrastructures** (i) For consideration of single work under category 1 & 3, submitted project has been considered under category 4. Please clarify	**a) M/s LNS Infrastructures** i) The bidder clarifies the project category for the submitted project.	M/s Sudhakara Infratech Private Limited already have 2 projects, one in Nagaland and one in Arunachal Pradesh hence as per RFP clause 2.1.15 the committee consider the bid as Technically non responsive.

6. The details of Technical Capacity, Financial Capacity and the Bid Capacity of the above bidders are as Annexure -I.

7. The **Technical Evaluation Committee (TEC)** in its 2nd meeting has discussed the evaluation and after deliberation status of evaluation is as below.

Sr. No.	Name of the Bidder	Status	No. of Projects held with NHIDCL
1	M/s Dev Yash Projects & Infrastructure Pvt. Ltd.	Technically Responsive	0
2	M/s Ganesh Ram Dokania	Technically Responsive	0
3	M/s Indian Electrical Services	**Technically Non Responsive**	0
4	M/s Indo Engineering Project Corporation	Technically Responsive	0
5	M/s Sudkhara Infratech Private Limited JV M/s LNS Infrastructure	**Technically Non Responsive(** As per clause 2.1.15 of RFP)	1 - Nagaland 1 - Arunachal Pradesh
6	M/s Roadridge Developers Private Limited JV M/s Sunshine Overseas Private Limited	Technically Responsive	0
7	M/s Satya Builders	Technically Responsive	0

9. The Technical Evaluation Committee (TEC) recommends to open the financial bid of the 5 technically responsive bidders after the approval of Competent Authority.

Meeting ended with vote of thanks to chair.

Ajay Ahulwalia
(ED-I)
Chairman

B. Shivprasad
(GM-Tech)
Member

A.K. Jha
(GM-Tech)
Member

Bhaskar Mallick
Manager -Fin.
Member